



11 March 2014

NOTE TO THE FILE

Subject: Draft Report on the discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012, 2013/2241(DEC)

Rapporteur: Mr Petri Sarvamaa

Further to the BEREC Office comments to the European Parliament Budgetary Control Committee from 24 February 2014 (MC (14) 37) and the comments from the Commission from 19 February 2014 (Ares (2014)408738) we would like to provide the CONT Committee with an updated status overview in respect to all the relevant activities undertaken by the BEREC Office in order to address the comments of the Parliament and observations of the European Court of Auditors (ECA). The improvements suggest have been part of the BEREC Office work throughout 2013 and significant progress has been made in accounting, budgetary and financial management practices, the implementation of the Internal Control Standards and the implementation of improved procedures in areas like recruitment, procurement, exceptions and assets management.

Whereas:

Pursuant to the provisions of Article 287 of the Treaty (TFEU), on the 10-14 February 2014, the ECA conducted its annual audit, in the premises of the BEREC Office, on the BEREC Office 2013 accounts. The progress and the current status with the observations for the previous financial years 2011 and 2012 was also analysed by the auditors and the conclusions communicated to the BEREC Office during the closure meeting on 14 February and in the following weeks when preparing the preliminary findings of the ECA.

COMMENTS BEREC Office to the Draft Report on the discharge 2012 and to the proposed amendments

1. Proposal for a European Parliament decision

Text of the Draft Report:

1. Postpones its decision on granting the Administrative Manager of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications discharge in respect of the implementation of the Body's budget for the financial year 2012 / Grants the Administrative Manager of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications discharge in respect of the implementation of the Body's budget for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 1 - Petri Sarvamaa:

1. Postpones its decision on granting the Administrative Manager of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications discharge in respect of the implementation of the Body's budget for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 2 - Ryszard Czarnecki, Philip Bradbourn, Derk Jan Eppink, Marta Andreasen:

1. Postpones its decision on granting the Administrative Manager of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications discharge in respect of the implementation of the Body's budget for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 3 - Jean-Pierre Audy:

1. Grants the Administrative Manager of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications discharge in respect of the implementation of the Body's budget for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 4 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

1. Grants the Administrative Manager of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications discharge in respect of the implementation of the Body's budget for the financial year 2012;

Comment BEREC Office	Postponing the discharge into quarter 4 2014 would not speed up the solid progress already made in the
	administrative practices of the organisation. We reassure that the recommendations from the Court's audit to the 2012
	have been and continue to be addressed seriously.

2. Proposal for a European Parliament decision

Text of the Draft Report:

1. Postpones its decision on the closure of the accounts of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012 / Approves the closure of the accounts of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 5 - Ryszard Czarnecki, Philip Bradbourn, Marta Andreasen, Derk Jan Eppink:

1. Postpones its decision on the closure of the accounts of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 6 - Petri Sarvamaa:

1. Postpones its decision on the closure of the accounts of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 7 - Jean-Pierre Audy:

1. Approves the closure of the accounts of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012;

Amendment 8 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

1. Approves the closure of the accounts of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications for the financial year 2012;

Comment BEREC Office	Postponing the discharge into quarter 4 2014 would not speed up the solid progress already made in the
	administrative practices of the organisation. We reassure that the recommendations from the Court's audit to the 2012
	have been and continue to be addressed seriously.

3. Motion for a resolution

Amendment 9 - Elena Băsescu:

Addition of new Citation 10a:

- having regard to the previous discharge reports of the Parliament;

Text of the Draft Report Recital A:

A. whereas, according to its financial statements, the final budget of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications ('the Body') for the

financial year 2012 was EUR 3 190 000

Amendment 10 - Monica Luisa Macovei:

A. whereas, according to its financial statements, the final budget of the Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications ("the Body") for the financial year 2012 was EUR 3 190 000, representing an increase of 170,6 % compared to 2011 and whereas the Body's entire budget derives from the Union budget;

Status overview BEREC Office	Due to the location of the BEREC Office from Brussels to Riga in 2010 and slower than planned recruitment of staff (one staff member recruited on 1 January and 18 positions out of 28 filled by 31 December 2011) the initial budget for 2011 was amended in August 2011 and reduced by 52%. The financial year 2012 was the BEREC Office's first full year of operations with 24 staff members recruited and with the budget of EUR 3,190,000. The set-up phase in 2011 as compared to 2012 explains the significant increase in the 2012 budget, but the years are not comparable as to the
	required expenditures.

Paragraph 1: Comments on the reliability of accounts

Text of the Draft Report:

1. Regrets that the Body's accounting system was still not validated by its accounting officer; calls on the Body to address this issue and to inform the discharge authority on the state of play regarding steps to be taken by 1 September 2014;

Amendment 11 - Petri Sarvamaa:

1. Regrets that the Body's accounting system was still not validated by its accounting officer; acknowledges from the Body that the accounting system has been validated in 2013;

Amendment 12 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

1. Notes that the Body's accounting system has been validated in 2013;

Status overview BEREC	The accounting system has been validated in 2013
Office	

Conclusions ECA during	Completed
annual audit in Feb. 2014	

Comments on the legality and regularity of transactions

Text of the Draft Report:

2. Regrets that the committed appropriations carried over, amounting to EUR 61 500 (10 % of the total committed appropriations carried over), did not correspond to legal commitments and were thus irregular; calls on the Body to take steps in order to avoid such situations in the future and to report on the steps to be taken by 1 September 2014;

Amendment 13 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

2. Notes that the Body only became financially autonomous in September 2011; appreciates, therefore, that the findings only referred to a very limited amount of time (three months) and to a very limited amount of budget (EUR 747 000); notes that the Body's recruitments were ongoing and that some of the administrative/financial positions were not covered yet;

Amendment 14 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

New Paragraph 2a

2a. Notes that the issues with carry-forwards at the end of 2012 were of a different nature due to the lack of experience of the available staff with the year-end closure activities; notes that due to the resignation of critical staff in financial and accounting roles in 2012, the year-end closure was managed largely by back-up staff brought in as support for operational functions;

Amendment 15 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

New Paragraph 2b

2b. Notes that the experiences learned in both 2011 and 2012 were addressed in 2013 by specifying the financial procedures and by providing additional refresher trainings to all financial actors; notes that additional attention was paid throughout 2013 to the correct opening of financial and legal commitments;

Status overview BEREC	The issues with carry-forwards in the end of 2012 were due to the lack of experience of the available staff with the
Office	year-end closure activities. Due to the resignation of critical staff in financial and accounting roles in 2012, the year-

Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Completed
	The experience learned both 2011 and 2012 were addressed in 2013 by specifying the financial procedures (incl. year-end carry-forwards) and by providing additional refresher trainings to all financial actors incl. the back-ups. Additional attention was paid throughout 2013 to the correct opening of financial and legal commitments. Also, extra care was taken in the end of 2013 to de-commit any appropriations not executed (RAL) in a timely manner.
	end closure was managed largely by the back-up staff brought in as support from the operational functions.

Comments on budget and financial management

Text of the Draft Report:

3. Notes with concern that budget monitoring efforts during the financial year 2012 resulted in a budget implementation rate of 63,4 % and that the payment appropriations execution rate was 66,16 %;

Amendment 16 - Petri Sarvamaa:

3. Notes with concern that budget monitoring efforts during the financial year 2012 resulted in a budget implementation rate of 63,4 % and that the payment appropriations execution rate was 66,16 %; calls on the Body to substantially improve budget monitoring efforts and the aforementioned rates of implementation and execution; expects the Body to report on the steps taken to remedy the situation by 1 September 2014;

Amendment 17 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

3. Notes that the results of the provisional accounts for 2013 show the improved performance as a result of the measures taken in 2013, with a budget implementation rate of 89,55 % and a payment appropriations execution rate of 76,57 %; notes that the additional role of a Budget Assistant has been suggested to improve the daily budget management;

Status overview BEREC Office	The results of the Provisional Accounts for 2013 show the improved performance as a result of measures taken in 2013:
	- the budget implementation rate (commitment appropriations) in 2013 - 89,55 %;
	- of payment appropriations execution rate in 2013 - 76,57 %.
	Further steps have been and will be taken in order to improve the budget monitoring and the implementation:

performance of the BEREC Office.	Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	The potential results of the further improvements with budget implementation will be available in the end of 2014. Not commented
- nomination of an additional role of a Budget Assistant;		- recent nomination of the BEREC Board Advisory Group in order for the Board to better address the administrative

Commitments and carryovers

Text of the Draft Report:

4. Regrets that some EUR 101 000 (45 % of the committed appropriations carried over from 2011) were cancelled; expresses concern that appropriations of EUR 545 000 (17 % of the total 2012 appropriations) were not used and had to be cancelled; regrets that the level of carry-overs of committed appropriations to 2013 was high at EUR 611 000 (19% of the total); believes that this indicates difficulties in the planning and/or implementation of the Body's activities, as the carry-overs for 2012 were mostly related to delayed recruitments and the absence of an effective policy to ensure the timely presentation and reimbursement of mission costs claimed by experts; calls on the Body to address the situation and to report to the discharge authority on the steps taken by 1 September 2014;

Amendment 18 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

4. Notes that the results in 2013 as to the signed provisional accounts 2013 show improvements concerning the de-commitment of committed appropriations carried over from 2012 to 2013 (28 % in 2013, 45 % in 2012), appropriations not used in 2013 (15 % in 2013, 17 % in 2012) and the carry-over of commitment appropriations from 2013 to 2014 (13 % in 2013, 19 % in 2012); notes that the carry-over of commitments from 2011 to 2012 cannot be compared with 2012 and 2013 as the Body only became financially autonomous in September 2011; welcomes the fact that in 2013, there are three additional staff members working on budget management, as compared to 2012; welcomes also the fact that the Body has addressed the long payment cycle of travel reimbursement payments by streamlining the procedure and shortening the deadlines for the submission of documents;

Status overview BEREC	The measures taken in terms of the improved procedures and additional allocation of staff are:
Office	- finalisation of Financial and Accounting Manuals;

	 refresher trainings to staff members, nomination of an additional role of a Budget Assistant.
	The results in 2013 as to the signed Provisional Accounts 2013 show improvements concerning the commitments and carry-overs:
	 de-commitment of committed appropriations carried over from 2012 to 2013 - 28% in 2013 vs. 45% in 2012; appropriations not used in 2013 - 15% in 2013 vs. 17% in 2012;
	- carry-over of commitment appropriations from 2013 to 2014 - EUR 461,983 (13% in 2013 vs. 19% in 2012).
	The carry-overs for 2012 were mostly related to the absence of an effective policy to ensure the timely presentation and reimbursement of travel costs claimed by experts. The long payment cycle of travel reimbursement payments was addressed by streamlining the procedure and shortening the deadlines for the submission of documents.
	Carry-over of commitments from year 2011 to 2012 can not be compared with 2012 and 2013 as the Body only became financially autonomous in September 2011.
Conclusions ECA during	Ongoing
annual audit in Feb. 2014	Carry-overs from 2013 to 2014 decreased to 461 983 euro or 13 % of 2013 committed appropriations (2012: 611 000 euro or 19 %). The carry-overs were mainly related to contracts signed in the second half of 2013 which cover activities in 2013 and 2014 (in 2012, carry-overs were mostly related to late reimbursements of mission costs claimed by experts).

Procurement and recruitment procedures

Text of the Draft Report:

6. Notes with concern that there is considerable room for improvement regarding the preparation, execution and documentation of procurement procedures; notes in particular that award procedures did not give sufficient attention to the price-quality ratio and that general award criteria had not been broken down further into sub criteria to allow a clear and comparable evaluation of the offers;

Amendment 19 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

6. Notes that there is considerable room for improvement regarding the preparation, execution and documentation of procurement procedures as the Body's procurement procedure was adopted in July 2012; emphasises that the Court of Auditors' comments during its 2011 audit in May 2012 were taken in consideration;

Amendment 20 - Ryszard Czarnecki, Philip Bradbourn, Marta Andreasen, Derk Jan Eppink:

6. *Expresses serious* concern that there is considerable room for improvement regarding the preparation, execution and documentation of procurement procedures; notes in particular that award procedures did not give sufficient attention to the price-quality ratio and that general award criteria had not been broken down further into sub criteria to allow a clear and comparable evaluation of the offers;

Status overview BEREC Office	The BEREC Office procurement procedure was adopted in July 2012, taking among others into consideration the comments of the ECA during its 2011 audit in May 2012. However, the corrections in the middle of 2012 could not redo the performance in the 1st half of 2012.
	The further improvement areas as pointed out by the ECA during its 2012 audit were addressed in 2013 by:
	 further specifying the procedure and including the descriptions of it together with the procurement check-lists in the Financial Manual; nominating the new role of a Procurement Officer in August 2013; decentralising the responsibility for procurement between the larger number of staff members and providing relevant training in 2013 to all the team members potentially being involved in the procurements.
Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Completed

Text of the Draft Report:

7. Regrets that the recruitment procedures examined showed significant shortcomings affecting transparency, namely that questions for written tests and interviews were set after the applications had been examined by the selection board, no threshold scores were set for admission to written tests and interviews and for inclusion in the list of suitable candidates, and nominations and changes in the composition of the selection board were not approved by the appointing authority;

Amendment 21 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

7. Notes that the Court of Auditors' comments during its audit in May 2012 were immediately taken into consideration; notes, however, that the corrections since June and July 2012 could not repeat the performance in the first half of 2012; welcomes the fact that in 2013, the recruitment procedure has been further specified and strictly followed;

Status overview BEREC Office	The comments of ECA during its 2011 audit in May 2012 were immediately taken into consideration (e.g. the approval by the Appointing Authority of the composition of the Selection Committee). However, the corrections since June and July 2012 could not redo the performance in the 1st half of year 2012. In 2013 the recruitment procedure has further been specified and strictly followed.
Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Completed

Text of the Draft Report:

8. Notes with concern that while most of the Body's staff have an administrative or support function and do not travel, they have all been provided with a mobile phone with a monthly limit up to EUR 50; expresses concern that there are no controls to monitor private use;

Amendment 22 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

8. Notes that an appropriate telecommunications policy has been developed based on the principles of the Court of Auditors' relevant policy, introduced in July 2013 and updated in January 2014;

Status overview BEREC Office	The appropriate telecommunications policy was developed based on the principles of the ECA relevant policy. The policy was introduced in July 2013 and further updated in January 2014.
Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Completed

Text of the Draft Report:

9. Regrets that the Body does not have a treasury policy; notes that as a result, at the end of 2012, all cash held by the Body (EUR 1 600 000) was held in one bank, which has a BBB credit rating;

Amendment 23 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

9. Welcomes the fact that a treasure policy has been implemented from July 2013 in collaboration with the relevant Commission services in line with the new Financial Regulations; notes that a contract with new banking service provider with a higher credit rating has been completed;

Amendment 24 - Ryszard Czarnecki, Philip Bradbourn, Marta Andreasen, Derk Jan Eppink:

9. *Deplores the fact* that the Body does not have a treasury policy; notes that as a result, at the end of 2012, all cash held by the Body (EUR 1 600 000) was held in one bank, which has a BBB credit rating

Status overview BEREC Office	The treasury policy has been implemented from July 2013 in collaboration with the relevant Commission services in line with the new Financial Regulations. Contract with new banking service provider with a higher credit rating A was signed in July 2013 and has been
	completed.
Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Completed

Text of the Draft Report:

10. Calls on the Body to report on the actions taken to remedy the aforementioned outstanding issues concerning procurement and recruitment procedures by 1 September 2014;

Amendment 25 - Karin Kadenbach:

New Paragraph 10a

10a. Regrets that the Body has provided limited information regarding conflicts of interests policy, referring only to conflicts of interests declarations being requested and making no mention of any code of conduct or policy in place; notes that there is nothing on the publication of the declarations, on awareness training in place, or the aim of bringing the organisation into line with the Guidelines issued by the Commission; calls on the Body to remedy this situation before 1 September 2014 and provide the discharge authority with details of the measures being taken in this domain, particularly because the organisation is made up of representatives of the national electronic communication regulators, and has to

advise those same regulators (as well as the Union institutions) which indicates a situation requiring a strong and transparent conflict of interest policy;

Amendment 26 - Monica Luisa Macovei:

New Paragraph 6a (?):

Prevention and management of conflicts of interests and transparency

Amendment 27 - Monica Luisa Macovei:

New Paragraph 10a

10a. Notes that personal conflicts of interests declarations are requested from the members of the Office Management Committee and the Board of Regulators as well as from its staff members and that declarations of conflicts of interests of the members of the recruitment Selection Committees has been updated, based on the recommendations from the Court of Auditors; calls on the Body to inform the discharge authority of its plan to review its conflict of interest arrangements based on the Commission's guidelines on the Prevention and Management of Conflict of Interest in EU Decentralised Agencies;

Amendment 28 - Monica Luisa Macovei:

New Paragraph 10b

10b. Observes that the CVs and Declarations of Interests of the members of the Management Committee, the Administrative Manager and senior management are not publicly available; calls on the Agency to remedy the situation as a matter of urgency;

Status	overview	BEREC
Office		

The Declarations of Interest and the Declarations of Commitment for the Members of the Board of Regulators and of the Management Committee, the Administrative Manager and the staff of the Office are signed. The declarations of the Board Members, their alternates and of the Administrative Manager are published in the Document Register on BEREC public website, according to Art. 21 of BEREC Regulation.

http://berec.europa.eu/eng/document_register/subject_matter/berec/declarations_of_interests_and_commitment/?qPage=1&

Declarations of conflicts of interests of the members of the recruitment Selection Committees has been updated, based on the recommendations from the ECA.

Principles of the Code of conduct have been documented in the Ethical principles/ Ethical Administrative Behaviour (Internal Control Standard 2), which was adopted in July 2013. Based on the similar guidelines of the Commission (Code of good Admin Behaviour, Rules of Staff conduct) and of the European Ombudsman. The document defines

the BEREC Office:

- ethical principles (integrity, transparency, impartiality, objectivity);
- principles of ethical administrative behaviour;
- principles on communication (disclosure of info, publications, communication with media, with stakeholders and citizens)
- rules for situations with ethical dilemmas and guidance for behaviour (conflict of interest, gifts and favours, outside activities, general behaviour).

The drafting of the Ethical principles/ Ethical Administrative Behaviour document was preceded by training on ethics for all staff members in November 2012 covered the main principles of professional ethics and staff obligations.

Internal audit

Text of the Draft Report:

- 11. Deplores the fact that there are a number of outstanding issues as regards the internal controls, namely that:
- the Office has not yet implemented the Internal Control Standards on 'Objectives and performance indicators' (ICS 5), 'Process and procedures' (ICS 8), 'Document management' (ICS 11) and 'Information and Communication' (ICS 12),

Amendment 29 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

Paragraph 11 - introductory part

11. Welcome the progress made in 2013 as regards the internal controls, namely that:

Amendment 30 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

Paragraph 11 - indent 1

- The introduction of a new budgeting principle included the review of the Objectives and performance indicators of the annual Work Programme, the process for financial management and procurement recruitment have been newly defined and specified; notes, furthermore, that the inventory of procedures (which involved the processing of personal data) was approved in July 2013, the document management policy has been reviewed as specified in the IAS implementation plan and an updated version will be adopted in 2014 and the Information and Communication Security policies were introduced in October 2013;

Status overview BEREC Office	The implementation of the Internal Control Standards is ongoing based on the multi-annual implementation plan over 2013-2015, which has been agreed with the Internal Audit Service (IAS). The following progress in 2013 has been made in respect to the observations from the ECA.
	'Objectives and performance indicators' (ICS 5): Activity Based costing and budgeting model (ABB) was developed with the external support in July 2013. The introduction of the new budgeting principle included the review of the objectives and the performance indicators of the annual Work Programme. The definition of objectives was revised and the performance indicators were better aligned with the specific objectives of the Work Programme activities.
	'Process and procedures' (ICS 8): The processes for the financial management, accounting, assets management, procurement, recruitment have been newly defined or further specified and documented in the Financial and Accounting manuals. The inventory of the procedures (which involve the processing of personal data) was approved in July 2013.
	'Document management' (ICS 11): The initial document management policy, which was adopted in 2012, has been reviewed as specified in the IAS implementation plan and an updated version will be adopted in 2014.
	'Information and Communication' (ICS 12): The required IT Security policies were introduced in October 2013.
Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Ongoing

Text of the Draft Report - indent 2:

- there is no procedure related to the registration and disposal of fixed assets and no physical inventory has been performed,

Amendment 31 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

Paragraph 11 - indent 2

- a physical inventory has been performed between July and September 2013;

Status overview BEREC Office	Physical inventory has been performed between July and September 2013.
Conclusions ECA during	Completed

annual audit in Feb. 2014	

Text of the Draft Report - indent 3:

- procedures concerning the establishment, approval and recording of exceptions and deviations from policies and procedures have not been implemented;

Amendment 32 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

Paragraph 11 - indent 3

- the procedure for the establishment, approval and recording of exceptions was adopted in June 2013 and a register of exceptions and deviations was already established in June 2012;

Status overview BEREC Office	The procedure for the establishment, approval and recording of exceptions was adopted in June 2013 and the register of exceptions and deviations was established in June 2012
Conclusions ECA during annual audit in Feb. 2014	Completed

Text of the Draft Report:

12. Calls on the office to remedy the situation and to report on its progress by 1 September 2014;

Amendment 33 - Pilar del Castillo Vera:

12. Calls on the *Body to continue improving its implementation of the budget*;

Amendment 34 - Ryszard Czarnecki, Philip Bradbourn, Marta Andreasen, Derk Jan Eppink:

12. Demands that the Body remedy the situation and report on its progress by 1 September 2014;

BEREC Office confirms that a solid progress has already been made in the administrative practices of the Body and reassures that the recommendations from the Court's audit to the 2012 have been and continue to be addressed
seriously.

<u>Amendment 35 - Gerben-Jan Gerbrandy, Jan Mulder, Chris Davies</u> Sub heading 7 a (new)

Performance

Amendment 36 - Gerben-Jan Gerbrandy, Jan Mulder, Chris Davies

Paragraph 11 a (new)

11a. Requests that the Body communicate the results and impact its work has on European citizens in an accessible way, mainly through its website;

Status overview BEREC	The BEREC Office has presented to the Management Committee a draft Communications Strategy. It was discussed
Office during Board's plenary meeting on 27 February 2014. The Communication Plan is expected to be approved	
	plenary meeting in May 2014. It includes measures for the improved communication to the stakeholders and the
	citizens through BEREC's website. The BEREC Office is also reviewing the website development contract with the
	service provider and plans to re-launch it in 2014, in order to improve the functionalities of the current website,

including better access to the citizens with disabilities.

Ando Rehemaa

BEREC Office Administrative Manager

Cc: G. Marby, A. Sihvonen-Punkka; F. Barros, J. Hamande, D. Jurjevic (BEREC Management Committee)

- R. Madelin, R. Viola, A. Whelan, V. Terävä, N. Falcone (DG CONNECT)
- V. Bagge (BEREC Office)